

Planning Report

Thursday, September 18, 2014

Midwestern Auto Group PUD Land Rover/Range Rover/Jaguar/Lamborghini 6325 Perimeter Loop Road

Case Summary

Agenda Item	1
Case Number	14-046AFDP
Proposal	Demolition of the Land Rover showroom and the construction of a new 30,000-square-foot showroom for the Land Rover/Range Rover and Jaguar franchises; a sky bridge connecting the proposed building to the main MAG building; and associated site improvements at the southeast corner of the intersection of Perimeter Loop Road with Perimeter Drive with a text modification to decrease the pavement setbacks.
Request	Review and approval of an <u>amended final development plan</u> and a <u>minor development text modification</u> under the Planned District provisions of Zoning Code Section 153.050.
Site Location	6325 Perimeter Loop Road South side of Perimeter Drive, between the intersections with Perimeter Loop Road and Venture Drive.
Applicant	MAG, represented by Bradley Parish, Architectural Alliance.
Case Manager	Claudia D. Husak, AICP, Planner II (614) 410-4675 chusak@dublin.oh.us
Planning Recommendation	<u>Approval of Minor Text Modification</u> In Planning's analysis, minor modifications to the development text will allow a successful business within the City of Dublin to continue operating in compliance with zoning requirements, facilitate the expansion of the business and provide additional ways of identifying vehicle brands on-site. The requested modification is to modify the development text to: <ol style="list-style-type: none">1) Decrease the pavement setback to 50 feet along US33/SR1612) Provide parking at a ratio of 1 space per service bay in Subarea A3) Allow an additional wall sign within Subarea

Approval of Amended Final Development Plan

In Planning's analysis, the proposal is consistent with the criteria for an amended final development plan with the approval of a minor text modification. Approval of this proposal is recommended with two conditions.

Conditions

- 1) That the plans be revised to address building material inconsistencies on sheet 4.01, and;
- 2) That the applicant work with Planning to identify additional areas for replacements trees, prior to submitting for a building permit.



Facts

Site Area	24.33 acres
Zoning	PUD, Planned Unit Development District
Surrounding Zoning and Uses	<p>North: PCD, office warehouse in Subarea C-1 of Perimeter Center</p> <p>East: PCD, vacant land in Subarea D of Perimeter Center</p> <p>South: US 33/SR 161</p> <p>West: PCD, the recently approved Learning Experience daycare and Talmer Bank</p>
Site Features	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • 4 buildings across the site, with the main building in the center, the existing Land Rover building in the north and the recently completed buildings for Audi and for BMW/Mini to the east. • Subarea A has two buildings: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ◦ An approximately 115,500-square-foot dealership building with several automotive brands such as Saab, Aston Martin, Bentley, Porsche, Volkswagen, and Volvo. ◦ A 7,335-square-foot building to the north houses the Land Rover franchise, facing Perimeter Drive. • Subarea B has two buildings: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ◦ An approximately 44,500-square-foot dealership building for BMW and Mini ◦ A 11,000-square-foot building for Audi • Frontage: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ◦ 650 feet along Perimeter Drive ◦ 1,000 feet along Perimeter Loop Road ◦ 1,400 feet along US33/SR 161 ◦ 1,550 feet along Venture Drive <p>Subarea A has 472 customer and employee parking spaces and 96,000 square feet of vehicle display area along all sides of the buildings. Vehicle display areas are designed in a unique finger-like arrangement along the northwest and southwest portions of the site.</p> <p>A retention pond is on the north side of the main building at the Perimeter Loop Road entrance. Mature landscaping and significant mounding are along the site perimeter and provide screening for the loading and vehicular use areas.</p> <p>Subarea B has 238 customer and employee parking spaces, and 54,511 square feet of vehicle display area along all sides of the buildings. Vehicle display areas are designed in a unique finger-like arrangement along the western and southern portions of the site.</p> <p>A retention pond is on the lot to the east and a decorative pond is located along the US33/SR161 frontage.</p>

Facts

Case Background

On June 5, 2014, the Commission commented informally on a request for review and feedback for the proposal for demolition of the existing Land Rover showroom and the construction of a new 33,000-square-foot showroom for the Land Rover, Range Rover and Jaguar franchises, a sky bridge for the Lamborghini franchise connecting the proposed building to the main MAG building and all associated site improvements. The Commissioners complimented the applicant on the development of the MAG campus. Commissioners largely agreed that the proposed building for Land Rover, Range Rover and Jaguar does not exemplify the same innovative and distinct architecture and massing as the existing buildings. The proposed materials were another concern in terms of proposed colors and number of materials and how they differ from materials currently used on the campus.

The Commissioners requested additional details regarding the proposed sky bridge including details regarding the area below the bridge, the pond edge treatment and the rear of the bridge where some Commissioners were concerned about the heavy block proposed for a large portion of the elevation. The Commission agreed that a reduction in the required parking may be appropriate but did not support the request for additional wall signs for this Subarea. Commissioners requested the applicant work with Planning to provide as many replacement trees as possible.

The site has undergone many modifications and building additions over the years and a detailed history is attached to the end of this report.

Details

Amended Final Development Plan

Proposal

This proposal includes the demolition of the existing 7,335-square-foot Land Rover building and the construction of a new 34,000-square-foot building to house the Land Rover, Range Rover and Jaguar franchises and a 6,560-square-foot sky bridge for the Lamborghini brand as a connection between the new building and the existing main dealership.

Plan Overview

The development text does not limit the building size; development intensity is regulated by setbacks, lot coverage and parking requirements.

The proposal includes a decrease of parking and display area. A portion of the stormwater management pond along the Perimeter Loop Road frontage will be removed to accommodate the sky bridge. The proposal also includes architectural details for the new showroom and sky bridge as well as three wall signs for the new building.

The application also includes a request for a minor development text

Details	Amended Final Development Plan
	<p>modification to align pavement setback requirements which will decrease due to right-of-way takes required by the Ohio Department of Transportation for improvements to the US33 and I-270 interchange.</p>
Layout	<p>The text for this development does not specifically address an expansion of this nature; however, the applicant is proposing to connect the existing buildings to make a more cohesive, visually unified campus. The proposed sky bridge will extend from the southern side of the addition, at the first floor level, over the pond to the second level of the main building, south of the pond. None of the access points are changing as part of this proposal. The new showroom building requires the existing service and loading area to be reconfigured to the rear of the building and the sky bridge. The configuration of the retention pond changes with this application and the proposed sky bridge is proposed to traverse the pond. The detention basin in the northeast corner of the site is proposed to be enlarged to meet stormwater management requirements.</p> <p>The sky bridge requires concrete and metal support legs that extend to the ground. The proposal also includes a new test track for Land Rover in the northeast portion of the site.</p>
Setbacks	<p>The development text requires a 60-foot setback for buildings and pavement along US33/SR161 for both Subareas. The site was developed with some of the display pavement areas on this setback line. ODOT is working with its design consultant, and the City of Dublin to complete the plan design for the US33/I-270 interchange upgrade. Construction of Phase 1 is projected to begin in 2015. To begin construction, right-of-way acquisition must be completed and MAG has been informed that required right-of-way takes impact compliance with the pavement setbacks required in the development text.</p> <p>The pavement areas were approved by the Commission and built in compliance with the zoning regulations. However, the taking of right-of-way will make the site non-compliant. Planning suggested the applicant request a minor modification to the development text that slightly decreases the pavement setback requirement from 60 feet to 50 feet to ensure zoning compliance is achieved. Based on the information provided by ODOT, the setback encroachment will be less than four feet. Planning suggests the setback be decreased in the text by 10 feet to provide flexibility should ODOT requirements change.</p>

Details	Amended Final Development Plan
Parking	<p>The development text requires one space per 300 square feet of building area for sales and office, one per 1,000 square feet of outdoor display area, and 3 spaces for each service bay. The plans indicate a parking requirement of 500 spaces and 405 spaces are provided. At the informal review, the applicant provided a parking overview from the dealership indicating operational parking needs and brand requirements. Approval of this proposal will require a minor text modification for the parking requirements. The Commission generally indicated support for this request. Planning supports a minor text modification to decrease the required parking for service bays from 3 spaces per bay to one space per bay, specifically 67 spaces versus 201 space.</p>
Architecture	<p>The approved development text states that architecture is to be modern and innovative, featuring the extensive use of glass and metal to promote transparency and a sleek, signature look across the front of the buildings, emphasizing sharp edges and angles. Permitted primary exterior materials include glass, metal, EIFS, stone/stone veneer and concrete masonry units. Flat roofs are permitted.</p> <p>The applicant has made significant changes to the architecture to address the concerns voiced by Commissioners in June. The proposed showroom building continues a modern architectural design with a flat roof and building accents. The roof line for the Land Rover/Range Rover/Jaguar building slopes from one end to the other along the front elevation to create a more angular design reminiscent of the main dealership building. A horizontal metal accent protruding along the front elevation brings an element similar to the BMW/Mini building to this side of the campus. The front elevation also includes a much more significant amount of glass providing a view to the building interior with exposed wood beams. The roof of the service bay along the eastern portion of the front elevation is also sloped.</p> <p>The green vertical metal accent and the sloped metal roof area with the stone water table continues to be included in the design as these elements signify the Land Rover and Range Rover brand. However these elements have somewhat diminished with the changes to the roof line and the overall appearance of the front elevation.</p> <p>The circular entry feature for the Jaguar brand is included along the west side of the front elevation, providing an additional entrance to the facility. The design of this element is much more integrated even though the color of the metal is more beige and the majority of the building is grey, including the metal door framing structure and the steel accent band. The architectural plans indicate the green Alucobond material is used near the Jaguar portico, which is not shown on the colored elevations. The architectural drawings should be updated.</p>

Details	Amended Final Development Plan
	<p>The sky bridge is the most unique part of the addition. It links the new building to the existing main dealership, beginning at the southern end of the proposed first floor showroom and extending over the existing retention pond to the northeast corner of the second floor of the southern building. The sky bridge will be mounted on a series of elevated concrete and steel supports. It will be approximately 260 feet long and rise 12 from grade at the proposed addition to the main building.</p> <p>More details are provided for the sky bridge, which is designed with two elevated elements, one providing access from the second floor of the main building to the first floor of the new building and the other being the Lamborghini showroom over the pond.</p> <p>The showroom is elevated on concrete columns with exposed metal while the rear bridge connector is set on exposed concrete panels.</p>
Building Materials	<p>Building materials are stucco in shades of grey for the majority of the building. Glass is the main material on the front elevation. The Jaguar entry is beige and composed of Alucobond. The Range Rover/Land Rover portion of the building also includes a metal panel and a sloped metal roof with floor to ceiling windows and a small portion of a stone water table.</p> <p>The materials for the sky bridge are concrete and metal for the supports, and aluminum panels for the front elevation. The front façade of the proposed sky bridge will have floor to ceiling windows. Corrugated metal and light and dark grey stucco are proposed for the rear. A fibre-cement rainscreen provides a connecting element between the two portions and is the material used on the Audi service write up area. The fasteners will be visible on this element.</p>
Signs	<p>Five types of signs are permitted for the MAG campus: campus identification, dealership identification, directional, brand, and wall signs. This proposal includes three wall signs on the north elevation. The previously proposed wall sign on the sky bridge has been eliminated. The development text did not anticipate this new building and sky bridge. The text currently permits only one wall sign identifying a single brand on the north façade of the northernmost building in this Subarea. The wall sign are permitted to be 25 feet in height.</p> <p>This proposal requests a 33.5-square-foot wall sign of the Land Rover oval logo and a 21.65-square-foot wall sign for the Range Rover franchise. The text limits the size of wall signs to 35 square feet. Both signs are proposed along the metal accent band on the north elevation at a height of 23.2 feet.</p> <p>A third sign is proposed in the western portion of the north elevation above the entrance to the Jaguar showroom. The sign has chrome letters</p>

Details	Amended Final Development Plan
Signs	<p>and the chrome Jaguar logo and measures 35 square feet. These are shown at approximately 24 feet high.</p> <p>As stated above, the development text was written for the existing building and sign and did not contemplate this redevelopment. As proposed the signs would require a development text modification. Planning suggests the applicant eliminate one of the three proposed wall signs and supports a development text modification to permit one additional wall signs at a size of 35 square feet and a height of 25 feet.</p> <p>The applicant should eliminate the third wall sign.</p>
Tree Replacements	<p>The plans show the removal of 354 inches of healthy trees about 6 inches in diameter and 224.5 inches are shown to be replaced. The applicant should work with Planning to identify additional areas where trees could be replaced particularly in the detention basin, prior to submitting for building permits.</p>
Stormwater Management	<p>The existing stormwater management for this area of the site will be modified as part of the project. The applicant has submitted preliminary stormwater management calculations for the proposal. They have not provided information on how they intend to comply with the redevelopment requirements in our stormwater design manual. This information will need to be provide prior to obtaining a building permit.</p>
Utilities	<p>Existing water and sanitary sewer services are used for the construction of the proposed building.</p>

Analysis	Minor Text Modifications
Overview	<p>The development text requires a 60-foot setback for pavement for this PUD along the southern property line. Right-of-way takes required by ODOT will decrease this setback slightly.</p> <p>The development text requires parking be provided at three spaces for each service bay in Subarea A. The proposed building and sky bridge require the removal of parking as well as additional spaces due to the increase in building square footage. The applicant has demonstrated that the parking provided will be sufficient to operate the business.</p> <p>One wall sign is permitted in the development text for Subarea A and the proposed building will accommodate additional brands with their own unique identification needs. The proposal includes two additional wall signs and Planning supports a minor development text modification to allow one additional wall sign.</p>

Analysis	Minor Text Modifications
Process	<p>Code Section 153.053(E)(2)(b)4 b permits the Commission to approve a modification to the development text and Zoning Code if they determine that all of the appropriate provisions are satisfied (full text of criteria attached). The requested modification is to modify the development text to:</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1) Decrease the pavement setback to 50 feet along US33/SR161 2) Provide parking at a ratio of 1 space per serine bay in Subarea A 3) Allow an additional wall sign within Subarea A

Recommendation	Minor Text Modifications
Approval	<p>Planning supports the minor modifications to the development text as they will allow a successful business within the City of Dublin to continue operating in compliance with zoning requirements, facilitate the expansion of the business and provide additional ways of identifying vehicle brands on-site.</p>

Analysis	Amended Final Development Plan
Process	<p>Section 153.050 of the Zoning Code identifies criteria for the review and approval for an amended final development plan (full text of criteria attached). Following is an analysis by Planning based on those criteria.</p>
<p>1) <i>Consistency with the approved preliminary development plan.</i></p> <p>Condition 1</p>	<p>Criterion met with Minor Text Modification and Condition: This proposal is consistent with the requirements of the proposed development text, as modified with this proposal and the preliminary development plan. Planning recommends the plans be revised to clarify the building materials on Sheet 4.01.</p>
<p>2) <i>Traffic & pedestrian safety</i></p>	<p>Criterion met: All pedestrian and vehicular safety requirements are met.</p>
<p>3) <i>Adequate public services & open space</i></p>	<p>Criterion met: The site has adequate public services. No open space dedication is required.</p>
<p>4) <i>Protection of natural features & resources</i></p>	<p>Criterion met: The proposed plans indicate tree replacement in accordance with the development text.</p>
<p>5) <i>Adequacy of lighting</i></p>	<p>Criterion met: The lighting continues the style of fixture of what is existing and uses advanced technology that eliminates hotspots.</p>
<p>6) <i>Signs consistent with preliminary development plan</i></p>	<p>Criterion met with Text Modification: If approved by the Commission, the text modification will ensure all proposed signs meet the preliminary development plan.</p>

Analysis	Amended Final Development Plan
<p>7) <i>Appropriate landscaping to enhance, buffer, & soften the building and site</i></p> <p>Condition 2</p>	<p>Criterion met with condition: The applicant should work with Planning to identify additional areas for replacements trees, prior to submitting for a building permit.</p>
<p>8) <i>Compliant stormwater management</i></p>	<p>Criterion met: Stormwater management for the site is accommodated in the stormwater management plan and will be finalized at the building permit stage.</p>
<p>9) <i>All phases comply with the previous criteria.</i></p>	<p>Not Applicable.</p>
<p>10) <i>Compliance with other laws & regulations.</i></p>	<p>Criterion met: The proposal complies with all other known applicable local, state, and federal laws and regulations.</p>

Recommendation	Amended Final Development Plan
<p>Approval</p>	<p>In Planning's analysis, this proposal complies with the proposed development text and preliminary development plan, the final development plan criteria and existing development in the area. Planning recommends approval of this request with two conditions.</p>
<p>Conditions</p>	<ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1) That the plans be revised to address building material inconsistencies on sheet 4.01, and; 2) That the applicant work with Planning to identify additional areas for replacements trees, prior to submitting for a building permit.

MAG Site History

2013

- PZC approved a material change for the rear elevation of the Audi building.

2012

- PZC approved amended final development plan for a separate Audi showroom and the incorporation of a non-public car wash for the BMW/Mini building.
- PZC approved an amended final development plan for the BMW/Mini showroom with conditions to remove the proposed Audi building from the plan and to revise the architecture to be more in line with other campus buildings and the approved BMW/Mini building.
- City Council approved a rezoning on March 12, 2012 for a 40,000-square-foot building with approximately 4,000 square feet for expansion area, 225 parking spaces and 57,000 square feet of vehicle display area for the BMW and Mini franchise.
- The Planning and Zoning Commission recommended approval of a rezoning with preliminary development plan and final development plan to develop additional land into the MAG PUD for the Mini and BMW franchises.

2011

- The Planning and Zoning Commission informally reviewed a proposal to incorporate additional land into the MAG PUD for the Mini and BMW franchises to move from Post Road.

2010

- City Council approved a rezoning with preliminary development plan that removed Subarea J and portions of Subareas D and J-1 from the Perimeter Center PCD and established a 15.6-acre MAG PUD.
- The Planning and Zoning Commission approved a final development plan with the recently constructed addition for the Volvo and Porsche franchises. The addition includes an owner's residential suite. This rezoning moved MAG out of the Perimeter Center Planned District and into a separate PUD (MAG plan).

2008

- City Council approved a rezoning with preliminary development plan to remove part of Subarea D place it into Subarea J-1 to accommodate a free-standing parking lot for the MAG dealership.
- The Planning and Zoning Commission disapproved an amended final development plan for exterior building modifications and a wall sign for Porsche franchise.
- The Planning and Zoning Commission recommended approval of a rezoning with preliminary development plan to remove part of Subarea D place it into Subarea J-1 to accommodate a free-standing parking lot for the MAG dealership.
- The Planning and Zoning Commission informally a proposal for exterior building modifications and a wall sign for Porsche franchise.
- The Planning and Zoning Commission informally reviewed a proposal to accommodate a free-standing parking lot for the MAG dealership.

2005

- The Planning and Zoning Commission approved an amended final development plan for the construction of an 18,081-square-foot expansion and skywalk addition for the MAG dealership.

2004

- The Planning and Zoning Commission approved a revised final development plan for architectural and site modifications to the Rolls Royce brand within the MAG dealership.

1998

- The Planning and Zoning Commission approved a development plan for the construction of the 7,335-square-foot Land Rover building within the MAG dealership.

1997

- The Planning and Zoning Commission approved a development plan for the construction of the 71,000-square-foot main MAG dealership building.
- Planning and Zoning Commission recommended approval and City Council approved a rezoning to create a 14-acre Subarea J of the Perimeter Center plan for auto dealerships and other uses, with several automotive franchises as a part of the Midwest Auto Group (MAG) campus.

4. Compliance with the preliminary development plan. In reviewing the application, the Planning and Zoning Commission shall determine if the final development plan substantially complies with all specific requirements, the purposes, intent and basic objectives of the preliminary development plan, and any commitments made or conditions agreed to with the adoption of the preliminary development plan and if it represents an expansion and delineation of the approved preliminary development plan.
 - a. Planning and Zoning Commission may determine that the proposed plan complies with the preliminary development plan and may proceed to review the Final Development Plan in accordance with the procedures of this section.
 - b. The Planning and Zoning Commission may, in reviewing the final development plan, approve a modification of a provision of the development standards text if they determine that all of the following provisions are satisfied:
 - (i) The Planning and Zoning Commission determines that, for this PD, the code compliance is not needed in order to ensure that the PD is consistent with the Community Plan and compatible with existing, approved, or planned adjacent development;
 - (ii) Planning and Zoning Commission determines that the proposed modification does not significantly alter the list of permitted or conditional uses, cause an inappropriate increase in density or cause inconsistencies with the Community Plan;
 - (iii) The proposed modification results in a development of equivalent or higher quality than that which could be achieved through strict application of the requirement(s);
 - (iv) The principles of § 153.052(B) are achieved; and
 - (v) The development, as proposed on the final development plan, will have no adverse impact upon the surrounding properties or upon the health, safety or general welfare of the community.
 - c. Any proposed modification to a preliminary development plan that fails to meet the above criteria shall require a zoning amendment to the preliminary development plan according to § 153.234.

AMENDED FINAL DEVELOPMENT PLAN

The purpose of the Planned Unit Development process is to encourage imaginative architectural design and proper site planning in a coordinated and comprehensive manner, consistent with accepted land planning, landscape architecture, and engineering principles. The PUD process consists of up to three stages:

- 1) Concept Plan (Staff, Commission, and/or City Council review and comment);
- 2) Zoning Amendment Request (Preliminary Development Plan; Commission recommends and City Council approves/denies); and
- 3) **Amended/Final Development Plan (Commission approves/denies).**

The intent of the final development plan is to show conformance with and provide a detailed refinement of the total aspects of the approved preliminary development plan (rezoning). The final development plan includes all of the final details of the proposed development and is the final stage of the PUD process. The Commission may approve as submitted, approve with modifications agreed to by the applicant, or disapprove and terminate the process.

Review Criteria

In accordance with Section 153.055(B) *Plan Approval Criteria*, the Code sets out the following criteria of approval for a final development plan:

- 1) The plan conforms in all pertinent respects to the approved preliminary development plan provided, however, that the Planning and Zoning Commission may authorize plans as specified in §153.053(E)(4);
- 2) Adequate provision is made for safe and efficient pedestrian and vehicular circulation within the site and to adjacent property;
- 3) The development has adequate public services and open spaces;
- 4) The development preserves and is sensitive to the natural characteristics of the site in a manner that complies with the applicable regulations set forth in this Code;
- 5) The development provides adequate lighting for safe and convenient use of the streets, walkways, driveways, and parking areas without unnecessarily spilling or emitting light onto adjacent properties or the general vicinity;
- 6) The proposed signs, as indicated on the submitted sign plan, will be coordinated within the Planned Unit Development and with adjacent development; are of an appropriate size, scale, and design in relationship with the principal building, site, and surroundings; and are located so as to maintain safe and orderly pedestrian and vehicular circulation;
- 7) The landscape plan will adequately enhance the principal building and site; maintain existing trees to the extent possible; buffer adjacent incompatible uses; break up large expanses of pavement with natural material; and provide appropriate plant materials for the buildings, site, and climate;
- 8) Adequate provision is made for storm drainage within and through the site which complies with the applicable regulations in this Code and any other design criteria established by the City or any other governmental entity which may have jurisdiction over such matters;
- 9) If the project is to be carried out in progressive stages, each stage shall be so planned that the foregoing conditions are complied with at the completion of each stage; and
- 10) The Commission believes the project to be in compliance with all other local, state, and federal laws and regulations.